Improving the Quality of Spiritual Care as a Dimension of Palliative Care:

A Consensus Conference Convened February 2009

Principal Investigators
Christina Puchalski, MD, MS, FACP
Betty Ferrell, PhD, MA, FAAN, FPCN

Supported by the Archstone Foundation, Long Beach, CA. as a part of their End-of-Life Initiative.

Executive Summary published in the *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, October 2009
The Project Team

**City of Hope National Medical Center, Duarte, CA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title/Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Betty R. Ferrell, PhD, MA, FAAN, FPCN</td>
<td>Co-Principal Investigator, Research Scientist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose Virani, RNC, MHA, OCN, FPCN</td>
<td>Project Director, Senior Research Specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. Cassie McCarty, MDiv, BCC</td>
<td>Spiritual Care Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shirley Otis-Green, MSW, LCSW, ACSW, OSW-C</td>
<td>Senior Research Specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. Pam Baird</td>
<td>Spiritual Care Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose Mary Carroll-Johnson, MN, RN</td>
<td>Editor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrea Garcia, BA</td>
<td>Project Coordinator</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**George Washington Institute for Spirituality and Health, Washington, DC**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title/Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Christina Puchalski, MD, MS</td>
<td>Co-Principal Investigator, Executive Director, GWish, Professor of Medicine and Hlth &amp; Sci, George Washington University SOM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laurie Lyons, MA</td>
<td>Instructional Designer, The Spirituality and Health Online Education and Resource Center (SOERCE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mikhail Kogan, MD</td>
<td>Co-Editor, The Spirituality and Health Online Education and Resource Center (SOERCE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janet Bull, MA</td>
<td>Associate Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Advisors

Harvey Chochinov, MD, PhD, FRCPC
Professor of Psychiatry
Cancer Care Manitoba
Winnipeg, MB, Canada

Holly Nelson-Becker, MSW, PhD
Associate Professor
University of Kansas,
Lawrence, KS

Chaplain Karen Pugliese, MA, BCC
Central DuPage Hospital,
Winfield, IL

George Handzo, MDiv, BCC, MA
Vice President, Pastoral Care Leadership & Practice
HealthCare Chaplaincy
New York, NY

Maryjo Prince-Paul PhD, APRN, ACHPN
Assistant Professor
Frances Payne Bolton School of Nursing
Case Western Reserve University
Cleveland, OH

Daniel Sulmasy, OFM, MD, PhD
Professor of Medicine and Medical Ethics
Schools of Medicine and Divinity
University of Chicago
Chicago, IL
Archstone Foundation

Joseph F. Prevratil, JD
President & CEO

E. Thomas Brewer, MSW, MPH, MBA
Director of Programs

Laura Giles, MSG
Program Officer

Mary Ellen Kullman, MPH
Vice President

Elyse Salend, MSW
Program Officer

Tanisha Metoyer, MAG
Program Associate

Connie Peña
Executive Assistant

Joseph F. Prevratil
The goal of palliative care is to prevent and relieve suffering (NCP, 2009)

Palliative Care supports the best possible quality of life for patients and their families (NCP, 2009)

Palliative care is viewed as applying to patients from the time of diagnosis of serious illness to death
Consensus Conference Goal

- Identify points of agreement about spirituality as it applies to health care
- Make recommendations to advance the delivery of quality spiritual care in palliative care
- 5 Key Elements of Spiritual Care provided the framework: spiritual assessment; models of care and care plans; interprofessional team training; quality improvement; and personal and professional development
The NCP Guidelines Address Eight Domains of Care:

- Structure and Processes;
- Physical Aspects;
- Psychological and Psychiatric Aspects;
- Social Aspects;
- Spiritual, Religious, and Existential Aspects;
- Cultural Aspects;
- Imminent Death; and
- Ethical and Legal Aspects.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National Consensus Project Guidelines Spiritual Domain</th>
<th>National Quality Forum Preferred Practices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Guideline 5.1
Spiritual and existential dimensions are assessed and responded to based upon the best available evidence, which is skillfully and systematically applied. | DOMAIN 5.
SPIRITUAL, RELIGIOUS, AND EXISTENTIAL ASPECTS OF CARE |
| | PREFERRED PRACTICE 20
Develop and document a plan based on assessment of religious, spiritual, and existential concerns using a structured instrument and integrate the information obtained from the assessment into the palliative care plan. |
| | PREFERRED PRACTICE 21
Provide information about the availability of spiritual care services and make spiritual care available either through organizational spiritual counseling or through the patient’s own clergy relationships. |
| | PREFERRED PRACTICE 22
Specialized palliative and hospice care teams should include spiritual care professionals appropriately trained and certified in palliative care. |
| | PREFERRED PRACTICE 23
Specialized palliative and hospice spiritual care professional should build partnerships with community clergy and provide education and counseling related to end-of-life care. |
• 40 national leaders representing physicians, nurses, psychologists, social workers, chaplains and clergy, other spiritual care providers, and healthcare administrators

• Develop a consensus-driven definition of spirituality

• Make recommendations to improve spiritual care in palliative care settings

• Identify resources to advance the quality of spiritual care
Consensus Conference (Cont’d)

- First draft prepared by investigators and advisors.
- Draft sent to conference participants pre course
- Consensus Conference included plenary sessions and working groups with facilitators in one of five identified key areas of spiritual care
Spirituality is the aspect of humanity that refers to the way individuals seek and express meaning and purpose and the way they experience their connectedness to the moment, to self, to others, to nature, and to the significant or sacred.

A Consensus Definition of Spirituality was Developed:
Post Conference Work Included:

- Synthesis of feedback from small group sessions
- Course evaluations
- Revised Consensus Report was reviewed by the conferences participants, the Advisors and a panel of peer reviewers with a total of 91 reviews submitted
- Final Consensus Report published in Journal of Palliative Medicine, October 2009
Recommendations for improving spiritual care are divided into seven keys areas:

I. Spiritual Care Models
II. Spiritual Assessment
III. Spiritual Treatment/Care Plans
IV. Interprofessional Team
V. Training/Certification
VI. Personal and Professional Development
VII. Quality Improvement
I. Spiritual Care Models

Recommendations

• Integral to any patient-centered health care system
• Based on honoring dignity
• Spiritual distress treated the same as any other medical problem
• Spirituality should be considered a “vital sign”
• Interdisciplinary
Inpatient Spiritual Care Implementation Model

Clinicians and Spiritual care providers

Key

- Process
- Transformative interaction

Clinicians: Chaplains, doctors, nurses, social workers
Community providers: community religious leaders, spiritual director, pastoral and community counselors, faith community nurses, PT/OT and others

Puchalski, Handzo, Wirtz, and Bull, 2009
Outpatient Spiritual Care Implementation Model

Patient

Spiritual history (MD/NP)

Re-referral to Chaplain or spiritual care

Re-eval

Outcomes

Community providers; Family & Friends

Clinicians and spiritual care providers

Patient process

Transformative interaction

Interprofessional collaboration

Key

Clinicians: Chaplains, doctors, nurses, social workers
Community providers: community religious leaders, spiritual director, pastoral and community counselors, faith community nurses, PT/OT and others

Puchalski, Handzo, Wirtz, and Bull, 2009
The Biopsychosocial-Spiritual Model of Care

II. Spiritual Assessment of Patients and Families

Recommendations

• Spiritual screening
• Assessment tools
• All staff members should be trained to recognize spiritual distress
• HCP’s should incorporate spiritual screening as a part of routine history/evaluation
• Formal screening by Board Certified Chaplain
• Documentation
• Follow-up
• Response within 24 hours
Spiritual Diagnosis Decision Pathways

Spiritual care providers (SCP):
- Chaplain-in-patient care
- Pastoral counselor
- Spiritual director
- Religious leader

Source: Fuchs, C., Hendric, G., Whisen, S., and Bull, J., 2009
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diagnoses (Primary)</th>
<th>Key feature from history</th>
<th>Example Statements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Existential</td>
<td>Lack of meaning / questions meaning about one’s own existence / Concern about afterlife / Questions the meaning of suffering / Seeks spiritual assistance</td>
<td>“My life is meaningless” “I feel useless”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abandonment God or others</td>
<td>lack of love, loneliness / Not being remembered / No Sense of Relatedness</td>
<td>“God has abandoned me” “No one comes by anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anger at God or others</td>
<td>Displaces anger toward religious representatives / Inability to Forgive</td>
<td>“Why would God take my child… its not fair”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concerns about relationship with deity</td>
<td>Closeness to God, deepening relationship</td>
<td>“I want to have a deeper relationship with God”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflicted or challenged belief systems</td>
<td>Verbalizes inner conflicts or questions about beliefs or faith Conflicts between religious beliefs and recommended treatments / Questions moral or ethical implications of therapeutic regimen / Express concern with life/death and/or belief system</td>
<td>“I am not sure if God is with me anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despair / Hopelessness</td>
<td>Hopelessness about future health, life Despair as absolute hopelessness, no hope for value in life</td>
<td>“Life is being cut short” “There is nothing left for me to live for”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grief/loss</td>
<td>Grief is the feeling and process associated with a loss of person, health, etc</td>
<td>“I miss my loved one so much” “I wish I could run again”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guilt/shame</td>
<td>Guilt is feeling that the person has done something wrong or evil; shame is a feeling that the person is bad or evil</td>
<td>“I do not deserve to die pain-free”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconciliation</td>
<td>Need for forgiveness and/or reconciliation of self or others</td>
<td>I need to be forgiven for what I did I would like my wife to forgive me</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isolation</td>
<td>From religious community or other</td>
<td>“Since moving to the assisted living I am not able to go to my church anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious specific</td>
<td>Ritual needs / Unable to practice in usual religious practices</td>
<td>“I just can’t pray anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious / Spiritual Struggle</td>
<td>Loss of faith and/or meaning / Religious or spiritual beliefs and/or community not helping with coping</td>
<td>“What if all that I believe is not true”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendations

• Screen & Access
• All HCPs should do spiritual screening
• Diagnostic labels/codes
• Treatment plans
• Support/encourage in expression of needs and beliefs
III. Formulation of a Spiritual Treatment Plan (cont’d)

- Spiritual care coordinator
- Documentation of spiritual support resources
- Follow up evaluations
- Treatment algorithms
- Discharge plans of care
- Bereavement care
- Establish procedure
Intervention – HCP / Pt. Communication

- Compassionate presence
- Reflective listening/query about important life events
- Support patient sources of spiritual strength
- Open ended questions
- Inquiry about spiritual beliefs, values and practices
- Life review, listening to the patient’s story
- Targeted spiritual intervention
- Continued presence and follow up
Intervention – Simple Spiritual Therapy

- Guided visualization for “meaningless pain”
- Progressive relaxation
- Breath practice or contemplation
- Meaning-oriented-therapy
- Referral to spiritual care provider as indicated
- Narrative Medicine
- Dignity-conserving therapy

Artwork by Nathalie Parenteau
Intervention – Patient Self-Care

- Massage
- Reconciliation with self and/or others
- Join spiritual support groups
- Meditation
- Religious or sacred spiritual readings or rituals
- Books
- Yoga, Tai Chi
- Exercise
- Engage in the arts (music, art, dance including therapy, classes etc)
- Journaling
IV. Interprofessional Considerations: Roles and Team Functioning

Recommendations

• Policies are needed
• Policies developed by clinical sites
• Create healing environments
• Respect of HCPs reflected in policies
• Document assessment of patient needs
• Need for Board Certified Chaplains
• Workplace activity/programs to enhance spirit
V. Training and Certification

**Recommendations**

- All members of the team should be trained in spiritual care
- Team members should have training in spiritual self-care
- Administrative support for professional development
- Spiritual care education/support
- Clinical site education
- Development of certification/training
- Competencies
- Interdisciplinary models
Recommendations

• Healthcare settings/organizations should support HCP’s attention to self-care/stress management
  > training/orientation
  > staff meetings/educational programs
  > environmental aesthetics

• Spiritual development
  > resources
  > continuing education
  > clinical context
VI. Personal and Professional Development (cont’d)

- Time encouraged for self-examination
- Opportunities for sense of connectedness and community
  > interprofessional teams
  > ritual and reflections
  > staff support
- Discussion of ethical issues
  > power imbalances
  > virtual based approach
  > opportunity to discuss
VII. Quality Improvement

**Recommendations**

- Domain of spiritual care to be included in QI plans
- Assessment tools
- QI frameworks based on NCP Guidelines
- QI specific to spiritual care
- Research needed
- Funding needed for research and clinical services
Conclusion

• Spiritual care is an essential to improving quality palliative care as determined by the National Consensus Project (NCP) and National Quality Forum (NQF)

• Studies have indicated the strong desire of patients with serious illness and end-of-life concerns to have spirituality included in their care
Conclusion (cont’d)

• Recommendations are provided for the implementation of spiritual care in palliative, hospice, hospital, long-term, and other clinical settings

• Interprofessional care that includes board-certified chaplains on the care team

• Regular ongoing assessment of patients’ spiritual issues

• Integration of patient spirituality into the treatment plan with appropriate follow-up with ongoing quality improvement

• Professional education and development of programs

• Adoption of these recommendations into clinical site policies
Conclusion (cont’d)

• Clinical sites can integrate spiritual care models into their programs

• Develop interprofessional training programs

• Engage community clergy and spiritual leaders in the care of patients and families

• Promote professional development that incorporates a biopsychosocial-spiritual practice model

• Develop accountability measures to ensure that spiritual care is fully integrated into the care of patients
SOERCE:
The Spirituality and Health Online Education and Resource Center

• Educational and clinical resources in spirituality, religion, and health

• Browse or search for articles, curricula, CE courses, tutorials, videos, practice guidelines, on-the-job tools, etc.

• Find resources to use

• Share resources you have created
Go to: www.gwish.org
Share your course materials, lectures, tutorials, etc.
Recently launched → Please submit!

Partnering with the MedEdPORTAL → formal peer review and wider dissemination of appropriate submissions

Questions?

Email: soerce@gwish.org
What Can You Do In Your Community?
### Consensus Conference Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sandra Alvarez, MD, FAAFP</th>
<th>James Duffy, MD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lodovico Balducci, MD</td>
<td>Liz Budd Ellmann, MDiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tami Borneman, RN, MSN, CNS</td>
<td>George Fitchett, DMin, PhD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Breitbart, MD</td>
<td>Gregory Fricchione, MD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katherine Brown- Saltzman, RN, MA</td>
<td>Roshi Joan Halifax, PhD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacqueline Rene Cameron, MDiv, MD</td>
<td>Carolyn Jacobs, MSW, PhD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ed Canda, MA, MSW, PhD</td>
<td>Misha Kogan, MD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlyle Coash, MA, BCC</td>
<td>Betty Kramer, PhD, MSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. Kenneth J. Doka, PhD</td>
<td>Mary Jo Kreitzer, PhD, RN, FAAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rabbi Elliot Dorff, PhD</td>
<td>Diane Kreslins, BCC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consensus Conference Participants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judy Lentz, RN, MSN, NHA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen G. Levine, PhD, MPH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Francis Lu, MD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brother Felipe Martinez, BA, MDiv, BCC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kristen L. Mauk, PhD, RN, CRRN-A, GCNS-BC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. Cecil &quot;Chip&quot; Murray</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. Dr. James Nelson, PhD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. Sarah W. Nichols, MDiv</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steven Pantilat, MD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tina Picchi, MA, BCC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Rabow, MD, FAAHPM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniel Robitshek, MD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Kay Sandor, PhD, RN, LPC, AHN-BC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. William E. Scrivener, BCC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen Skalla, MSN, ARNP, AOCN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharon Stanton, MS, BSN, RN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alessandra Strada, PhD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeanne Twohig, MPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Consensus Conference Participants